# Summary: EXS, EXW, ICC

# Abhijit Sen



## 25<sup>th</sup> IAEA Fusion Energy Conference

## St. Petersburg, 13-18 October, 2014

## Thanks to all authors and overview speakers who sent slides Special thanks to C. Greenfield, P. Kaw, H. Yamada

## Outline

# TopicNumber of PapersMagnetic Confinement Expts: Stability (EXS)56Magnetic Confinement Expts: Waves (EXW)54Innovative Confinement Concepts (ICC)15

## Subtopics for EXS & EXW (guided by ITER priority needs)

- **Disruptions/Runaways** (control, mitigation, prediction)
- ELMS (control, mitigation) & 3D physics
- Waves and Energetic Particles
- MHD instabilities (nonlinear interactions, control)
- Current Drive & RF Heating

## Disruptions / Runaways – a major concern for ITER operation

## Main Issues

EX/P3-18, Campbell

- Uncertainties associated with disruption loads that can impact the structural integrity of the machine
- How to limit the number of disruptions to protect machine life
  - Disruption avoidance /control
  - Disruption prediction
- Need for a reliable disruption mitigation system (thermal, current and runaway mitigation) input required before final design review 2017
- Many gaps in physics basis and a lack of fundamental understanding

## Disruption Research has Increased and Become More Focused since the 2012 FEC

#### Prediction and avoidance

- ✓ Both empirical and theory-based
- Halo currents measurements and modeling
- ✓ Exploration of various techniques for disruption avoidance
- Characterization
  - Enlarged experimental database + modeling has led to improved understanding
  - ✓ Asymmetric events causes and consequences
- Mitigation and control
  - ✓ Thermal/current quench mitigation experiments
  - ✓ Runaway generation and control

**ITPA has played a major role** in coordinating and contributing towards joint experimental + modeling activities

## Disruption Avoidance / Control

#### EX/P2-42, Okabayashi

Avoidance of tearing mode locking and disruption with electro-magnetic torque introduced by feedback-based mode rotation control in **DIII-D** and **RFX-mod** 



EX/ P8-4, Jayhyun Kim

Plasma is less susceptible to minor disruption of n=1 locked mode under stronger n=2 even field.



## Disruption Avoidance / Control

#### EX/P4-18, Maurer

Strong 3D equilibrium shaping, applied to tokamak like discharges on the **Compact Toroidal Hybrid (CTH)** expand its disruption free operating regime

## EX/5-3, Tanna; EX/P7-16, Kulkarni; EX/P7-17, Dhyani

- Disruption control using biased electrodes in ADITYA tokamak to control MHD modes
- Similar effects also observed with the use of ICRF at the edge



## **Asymmetrical Disruptions in JET and COMPASS**

#### P5-33, Gerasimov

- Highlights the frequent occurrence of asymmetric disruptions in JET and the magnitude of their consequent sideways forces
- Resonance rotation with the natural vessel frequencies
- 3D JET model calculations for vessel poloidal currents
- Comparison with COMPASS data consistency in terms of amplitude of asymmetry and rotation behaviour





## Thermal and Current Quench Mitigation

EX/P2-22, Eidietis

- Measurement of Radiated Power Asymmetry During Disruption Mitigation on the DIII-D Tokamak
- radiation asymmetry during the thermal quench (TQ) and current quench (CQ) is largely insensitive to the number or location of injection sites
- application of an n=1 error field can modify the magnitude of the asymmetry during the TQ, supporting recent modeling results that indicate n=1 MHD during the TQ may be a cause of the radiation Asymmetry
- results provide a firmer understanding of the 3D physics affecting the ITER DMS design





- Massive gas injection radiation efficiency decreases down to 75% at high plasma thermal energy content (W<sub>th</sub>/(W<sub>th</sub>+W<sub>mag</sub>) = 0.5)
- Toroidal radiation asymmetries depend on mode lock phasing before the disruption.
- Runaway electrons at JET-ILW can be produced in similar conditions as with the carbon wall using argon MGI
- Runaway electron beams can be stopped if low-Z gas (D<sub>2</sub>) is injected before the thermal quench
- Mitigation of already accelerated beams (during current quench) using either high-Z or low-Z gases is ineffective in the mitigation pressure range tested.
- Impacts of ~770 kA RE beam leads to significant melting of PFC.
- Radiation asymmetries studies using two disruption mitigation valves are planned.
- Investigation of mitigation of an already accelerated runaway beam using higher pressures is planned

EX/5-2, Reux

 Investigation of runaway beams relation to vertical stability, control and plasma shape is to be continued Sen, EXS+EXW+ICC Summary 25th IAEA FEC

#### C. Reux et al.

24th IAEA FEC 10/2014

10



- Massive gas injection radiation efficiency decreases down to 75% at high plasma thermal energy content (W<sub>th</sub>/(W<sub>th</sub>+W<sub>mag</sub>) = 0.5)
- Toroidal radiation asymmetries depend on mode lock phasing before the disruption.
- Runaway electrons at JET-ILW can be produced in similar conditions as with the carbon wall using argon MGI
- Runaway electron beams stopped *only* by low-Z gas injected before current quench
- Miligation of aneady accelerated beams (during current quench) using entrer high-Z or low-Z gases is ineffective in the mitigation pressure range tested.
- Impacts of ~770 kA RE beam leads to significant melting of PFC.
- Radiation asymmetries studies using two disruption mitigation valves are planned.
- Investigation of mitigation of an already accelerated runaway beam using higher pressures is planned
- Investigation of runaway beams relation to vertical stability, control and plasma shape is to be continued Sen, EXS+EXW+ICC Summary 25th IAEA FEC

#### C. Reux et al.

## Runaway Generation / Control

#### An ITPA joint experiment to study runaway electron generation and suppression

A study of runaway electrons under well-controlled, well-diagnosed conditions in a number of tokamaks finds that the threshold *E*-field for both onset and decay of runaway electron (RE) signals is at least 4 - 5 times above the Connor-Hastie  $E_{crit}$ 

 Conversely, the density at which RE's are suppressed for a given loop voltage is at least a factor of 4-5 less than theoretically predicted

This suggests that there are other significant RE loss mechanisms in addition to collisional damping, even in steady-state quiescent plasmas.

It also suggests that mitigating runaways on ITER may not require fueling to the Rosenbluth density.



## **DIII-D Expt on RE Mitigation using SPI**

- Injection of Ne Shattered Pellets into early CQ is effective in suppressing runaway growth
- RE current dissipation explained by RE-ion pitch angle scattering
  - Higher Z more effective at RE dissipation

EX/PD/1-1, Eidietis

Neonso **Ne SPI impacts** at RE edge RE Seed **Cold CQ** Plasma **RE seed in core** 10 10 Integrated HXR (au) Minimal or No **RE** suppression 10<sup>2</sup> Suppressed RE 10 3 CQ Spike (MS)

ELMS – Characterization / Mitigation / Suppression

## Progress since 2012 FEC

- RMP ELM mitigation and suppression of Type I ELMs
  - ✓ Expanded operating space
  - ✓ Shown to be robust to loss of coils (reassuring for ITER)
- Alternate external suppression methods appear promising
  - Pellet pacing, SMBI, gas injection, LHW,...
- Improved understanding of ELM dynamics from better diagnostic measurements and modeling studies – also some challenges

## **Expanded Operating Space**



## EX/1-2, Kirk

Sustained ELM mitigation/type I ELM suppression has been achieved on MAST and AUG with magnetic perturbations with a range of toroidal mode numbers

ELM size and target heat loads are reduced but at a price of a reduction in confinement

Dashed curves expanded operating space for the type I ELM suppression/mitigation from MAST and ASDEX Upgrade

Results show that regimes with tolerable ELMs can be established over a wide operating space in a range of devices

13-18 Oct., 2014

0.8

31128 n=2

31134 n=4

32

## **Advances in Basic Understanding of ELM Suppression**

 ELM suppression achieved with as few as 5 internal coils



EX/1-1, Wade; EX/P2-21, Orlov

 New data reveals bifurcation indicative of resonant field penetration at ELM suppression



Highlights importance of plasma response to RMP fields

## Successful ELM-Suppression Using Low n RMPs and Its Understanding as a New ('bursty') H-Mode State EX/1-5, Jeon

2.7MW

#9286

2.0

**RMP** field

New H-mode

3.0

confinement reduction

0.40

0.10

2.00

1.25

0.50

7.00

4.50

2.00

0.35

0.25

0.15



- n=1 RMP for  $q_{95}$ =5.5°6.0 (nigh) - n=2 RMP for  $q_{05}$ =3.7~4.0 (low) • ELM-suppression = a new state of H-mode (so called, 'bursty' H-mode)

βn

Two stationary ELM states under same

- Mitigated ELMs : confinement ↓

Suppressed ELMs: confinement ↑

A possibility of ELM suppression without

5.0

Time (sec)

4.0

2014-10-14

IAEA-FEC-2014-YMJ

IFEC=6.0kAt

∆n<sub>e</sub>

7.0

6.0

0.69

8.0

## Simultaneous Measurement of ELMs at both High and Low Field Sides in KSTAR



- Comparable mode strength at HFS and LFS
- Asymmetries in toroidal/poloidal rotation velocities
- Mode structure at HFS not consistent with Ballooning Mode model
- Mode numbers different on the two sides

EX/8-1, Park

## **ELM mitigation by Lower Hybrid Waves in EAST**



EX/P3-8, Liang

- ELM mitigation with LHW obtained over a wide range of q<sub>95</sub>
- Attributed to formation of helical current filaments in SOL
- ELM freq. increases from 150 Hz to about 1 KHz



Sen, EXS+EXW+ICC Summary 25th IAEA FEC 13-18 Oct., 2014

# Other MHD and 3D physics studies

- Improved understanding of Neoclassical Toroidal Viscosity (NTV) in tokamaks
- Feedback control of RWM allows tokamak operation at q<sub>95</sub>≤2
- Helical modes observed in KSTAR
- Basic studies of MHD instabilities

#### Neoclassical Toroidal Viscosity for Rotation Control and the Evaluation of Plasma

Response

#### EX/1-4, Sabbagh

## **Highlights**

#### Experimental NTV characteristics

- NTV experiments on NSTX and KSTAR
- NTV torque  $T_{NTV}$  from applied 3D field is a radially extended, relatively smooth profile
- **D** Perturbation experiments measure  $T_{NTV}$  profile

#### Aspects of NTV for rotation control

- □ Varies as  $\partial \mathbf{B}^2$ ;  $T_{NTV} \propto T_i^{5/2}$  in primary collisionality regime for large tokamaks
- No hysteresis on the rotation profile when altered by non-resonant NTV is key for control
- Rotation controller using NTV and NBI tested for NSTX-U; model-based design saves power

#### NTV analysis to assess plasma response

- Non-resonant NTV quantitatively consistent with fully-penetrated field assumption
- Surface-averaged 3D field profile from M3D-C<sup>1</sup>
   single fluid model consistent with field used for quantitative NTV agreement in experiment Summary 25th IAEA FEC

#### Perturbation experiments measure NTV torque

#### profile and compare to theory



#### **Rotation controller using NTV and NBI**



13-18 Oct., 2014

## DIII-D and RFX-mod achieved reproducible tokamak operation at $q_{95}$ <2 thanks to feedback control of 2/1 RWM – for many resistive wall times using 3D magnetic fields







#### Blue curve: with feedback control

Red curve: w/o feedback control

#### Active MHD control has resulted in RWM-stabilized, high- $\beta_{\rm p}$ , low-A RFP plasmas, and two routes to helical RFP states are identified



Using saddle coil array for feedback MHD control, RWM was suppressed and the RFP discharge duration could be extended to the upper bound determined by the iron core saturation.



Central electron pressure vs. Ip<sup>2</sup> shows that feedback stabilization of RWM has led to improved performance with attainment of electron poloidal beta10~15%. Density limit studies are becoming important in low-A RFP.



Growth of both the resonant (left) and non-resonant (left) Reconstructed magnetic surface shape using SXR mode can lead to self-organized helical RFP with almost CT during QSH phase shows good agreement with identical deformation. Resonant mode accompanies, +ICC Summary nelical equi-pressure surface shape in 3-D MHD 23 reconnection (MIPS simulation). 13-18 Oct., 2014 simulation using the MIPS code.





## EX/P8-12: Helical modes induced by localized G.S. Yun POSTECH, Korea sawtoothing KSTAR plasmas

# Multiple flux tubes (MFTs), a universal feature in plasmas with localized ECH heating

- Dynamics of MFTs visualized by 2D imaging: growth, steady-state (~ms), merging (~10 μs), and crash (~10 μs).
- Number of flux tubes strongly depends on the ECH position relative to q=1 surface.

#### Nonlinear Reduced MHD simulation with an empirical current source model:

- 1) Flat q-profile (|1 q| < 0.5%) after crash
- 2) Growth and saturation of m/n=1/1 helical flux tubes driven by localized ECH
- 3) Merging of flux tubes

# $(#9214, t=5.00s) +2800 \ \mu s +3000 \ \mu s$



#### Ongoing study focuses on:

- 1) Dependence on the ECH injection angle (i.e., width and amount of the driven current)
- 2) Identification of q profile after sawtooth crash
- 3) Self-consistent modeling of the ECH coupling, with the flux tubes

## (R)MHD INSTABILITIES – BASIC STUDIES

**Questions addressed: Triggering mechanisms, Mode Dynamics** 

#### FTU &TCV:

- 2/1 TM triggered by Ne injection **EX/P2-53, Botrugno**
- TM onset by central EC power deposition EX/P2-54,Nowak



#### HL-2A:

- NTM triggered by intrinsic error fields EX/P7-19, Xu
- NTM triggered by non-local transport EX/6-4, Ji
- Interaction between
   MHD modes EX/P7-25, Yu



SMBI induced NLT

## LHD:

- Effects of low n MHD modes on achievable beta values EX/P6-37
- Bursting Resistive Interchange Modes EX/P6-36



### **Energetic-Ion-Driven-Resistive** Interchange Mode (EIC)

## Sen, EXS+EXW+ICC Summary 25th IAEA FEC

## Energetic Particles / Waves

## Main Issues

- Good confinement of EPs crucial for α heating of burning plasmas
- Instabilities driven by EPs can degrade their confinement and also alter their energy distribution; also impact on NB-CD
- Characterization of stability boundaries
- Better understanding of fast ion transport

## Progress since 2012 FEC

- Improved diagnostics, better nonlinear modeling have furthered our understanding on a number of issues
- Exptal database extended to include STs, stellarators, RFPs etc.
- Provide more accurate correlations between fast ion losses & instabs.





Utilizing a new scintillator-based lost fast-ion probe, recent HL-2A experiments have elucidated a variety of neutral beam ion loss behaviors in the presence of MHD instabilities.

#### TJ-II

#### EX/P4-46, Cappa



ECRH has a strong influence on the NBI driven Alfvén modes in TJ-II. A second EC beam can stabilize the AE.



## EX/10-4: Effects of MHD instabilities on Neutral Beam current drive

M. Podestà, M. Gorelenkova, D. S. Darrow, E. D. Fredrickson, S. P. Gerhardt, W. W. Heidbrink, R. B. White

- Neutral Beam heating and current drive are crucial for the success of ITER, Fusion Nuclear Science Facility (FNSF) MHD instabilities (e.g. Alfvénic modes, AEs) can reduce NB-CD efficiency
- A new model is developed to quantify and predict AE effects on NB-CD [Podestà, PPCF 56 (2014) 055003]

 Fast ion evolution is consistently treated in phase space (energy, canonical angular momentum, magnetic moment)

- Interactions modeled through kick probability  $p(\Delta E, \Delta P_{z}|E, P_{z}, \mu)$
- Implementation in the transport code TRANSP under way
- Results from NSTX confirm strong effect of AEs on NB-CD

NSTX-U

- Up to 40% of local current density can be redistributed
- •Effects not correctly accounted for by models based on ad-hoc spatial diffusion



∐0.8 P0



## Fast-ion response to externally applied 3D magnetic perturbations



strong plasma & fast-ions response is observed in H-mode regimes with low collisionality / density and low q95.



 / q95.
 Pitch angle and energy resolved measurements

 + wide field-of-view infrared imaging show fast

 ion losses correlated with applied 3D fields.

 in L-mode plasmas. Good agreement with model

 Sen, EXS+EXW+

#### EX/P6-58, Kornev

#### **TUMAN -3M**



# Plot of neutron flux vs time for different inward shifts of column

## EX/P1-33, Bakharev

#### **GLOBUS-M**



Particle losses highly correlated with TAE

- Sawteeth induced losses >25%
- Shift in plasma column inwards can reduce losses

•

# **Noninductive Current Drive**

- Studies of LHCD physics and applications
- ICRH optimization in JET
- Solenoid-free ST startup

## **Near-Field Physics of Lower-Hybrid Wave Coupling**



Loss of LHCD efficiency at high density is associated with Excitation of Parametric Decay Instabilities. PDI are excited near the separatrix and onset can be mitigated by modifying conditions in the scrape-off layer. Launch from HFS may be more efficient – scheme for next machine.

#### EX/P3-11, Ding

EAST

High density experiments with LHCD analyzed by simulation using experimental parameters, show that parametric instability, collision absorption in the edge region, and density fluctuations could be Sen, EXS+EXW+ICC Summa version of the low current drive efficiency at high density.

25th IAEA FEC 13-18 Oct., 2014

**EX/P6-20, Delgado-Aparacio:** Destabilization of Internal Kink by Suprathermal Electron Pressure Driven by Lower Hybrid Current Drive (LHCD)



• A new type of periodic fishbone-like instability with a (1,1) internal kink-like structure

• *distinct from the sawtooth instability* 

On-axis SXR signatures of a (1,1) internal kink-like (IK) mode in the a) presence or b) absence of Sawtooth precursors (SP) and crashes (SC).

#### Demonstrate a direct dynamic relation between LHCD generated fast electrons and a fishbone-like mode



- Proximity between antenna and outer midplane (OMP) gas injection maximises the effect of local gas injection on ICRF antenna coupling resistance (JET, AUG, DIII-D).
- Top injection leads to a lower coupling improvement, toroidally uniform.
- To assess efficiency of local gas injection on ITER ICRF antenna coupling, need to take into account the field lines topology and use 3D SOL modelling codes.



#### Fully Non-inductive Current Drive Experiments using 28 GHz and 8.2 GHz Electron Cyclotron Waves in QUEST H. Idei, et al.





Plasma current of 54 KA was noninductively sustained for 0.9 sec by only 28 GHz injection.

Plasma shaping was almost kept for 1.3 sec.

Higher current of 66 kA was noninductively obtained by slow rampup of vertical field also.

Non-inductive high current plasma start-up by 2<sup>nd</sup> ECH/ECCD has been demonstrated.

#### Over Dense Plasma Sustainment by 28 /8.2 GHz Injections after Spont Density Jump



Spontaneous density jump across the cutoff density was observed in superposed 28 and 8.2 GHz injections.

H $\alpha$  intensity was kept, magnetic axis  $R_{ax}$  and minor radius *a* were slightly decreased in the density jump case.

Plasma current  $I_p$  was once decreased, but was recovered after the plasma shaping became more stable. Non-inductive Plasma Start-up Experiments on the TST-2 Spherical Tokamak Using Waves in the Lower-Hybrid Frequency Range Y. Takase for the TST-2 Group

- Economically competitive tokamak reactor may be realized at low A
   = R/a by eliminating the central solenoid
   → Objective: Demonstrate I<sub>p</sub> ramp-up by LHW on ST
- Three antennas were used:
  - Combline antenna
    - Nonlinear excitation of LHW
  - Grill (dielectric-loaded WG array) antenna
    - Optimum  $n_{\parallel}$ : 3-4
  - CCC (capacitively-coupled combline) antenna
    - Highest  $\eta_{CD}$  achieved (sharp  $n_{\parallel}$  spectrum, good directivity)
- Characteristics of LH driven plasma
  - Pressure dominated by fast electrons
    - 3-fluid equilibrium being developed
    - Importance of E<sub>r</sub> and flows
  - Fast electrons are poorly confined at  $I_{\rm p}$  ~ 10 kA
    - η<sub>CD</sub> much smaller than in typical tokamak experiments
       Due to poor orbit confinement of fast electrons
    - Expected to improve significantly at higher I<sub>p</sub> and B<sub>t</sub> (need power supply upgrade)
- Various diagnostics and analysis tools are being developed
  - Wave diagnostics,  $H^{Xe}profile, H^{CC}$  flows  $2^{5}profile, etc.$



CCC antenna



## Innovative Confinement Concepts

## 15 papers

- ✓ Tokamaks with novel magnetic configurations
- ✓ Advances in Field Reversed Configurations
- ✓ Spherical Configurations other than tokamaks (HIT-SI)
- Advances in Spherical Tokamaks (TS4)
- ✓ New ideas/concepts for fusion reactors

#### Negative triangularity tokamak: stability limits and perspectives as fusion energy system



## Control of Rotational Instability in FRC



- Toroidal spin-up in an FRC triggers a centrifugally- driven interchange-like mode n = 2.
- Suppression of Spontaneous Rotation in a FRC by Magnetized Plasmoid Injection in NUCTE device



ICC/P5-43, Asai

## Spherical Configuration

- Significant progress on Current Drive in HIT-SI
- By increasing the frequency of the Imposed Dynamo Current Drive (IDCD) up to 68.5 kHz
- Toroidal currents of 90 kA and current gains of nearly 4, a spheromak record, have been achieved.
- dynamo current drive does not need plasma-generated fluctuations -a stable equilibrium with profile control can be sustained with imposed fluctuations
- Extrapolation to ITER 80 kHz gives injector powers less than 10 MW and δB/B ≈ 10<sup>-4</sup> indicating the effect on confinement may be acceptable.



## 1 Gwe Reactor Dynomak Jarboe

## **Concluding Remarks**

- EXS, EXW:
  - Focused international efforts on ITER relevant issues has considerably advanced our understanding on ELM physics and disruption phenomena
  - Runaway mitigation system not yet firmly established
     but there are promising leads that need to be followed
  - Alternate ELM mitigation systems that do not require IVCs show considerable promise and may provide an attractive future option for ITER
  - New ideas on disruption avoidance and control need validation on larger machines

## **Concluding Remarks**

## ICC:

- Heartening to see good scientific progress in alternatives to the tokamak/stellarator approach e.g. Spheromaks, FRCs ....
- Exploration and development of such alternate schemes essential for improving our chances of early fusion power we need to promote more new ideas

Exciting week - wealth of scientific results - wonderful hospitality Thanks to our hosts and IAEA