



### **Overview of Recent Physics Results from NSTX**

Coll of Wm & Mary Columbia U CompX **General Atomics** FIU INL Johns Hopkins U LANL LLNL Lodestar MIT Lehigh U **Nova Photonics** ORNL PPPL **Princeton U** Purdue U SNI Think Tank. Inc. **UC Davis UC** Irvine UCLA UCSD **U** Colorado **U Illinois U** Maryland **U** Rochester **U** Tennessee **U** Tulsa **U** Washington **U Wisconsin** X Science LLC

#### S.M. Kaye (Presented by S.A. Sabbagh)

PPPL, Princeton University Princeton, NJ 08543 USA

> FEC IAEA Mtg. St. Petersburg, RU 18-23 October 2014



\*This work supported by the US DOE Contract No. DE-AC02-09CH11466

Culham Sci Ctr York U Chubu U Fukui U Hiroshima U Hyogo U Kyoto U Kyushu U Kyushu Tokai U NIFS Niigata U **U** Tokyo JAEA Inst for Nucl Res. Kiev loffe Inst TRINITI Chonbuk Natl U NFRI KAIST POSTECH Seoul Natl U ASIPP CIEMAT FOM Inst DIFFER ENEA. Frascati CEA. Cadarache **IPP, Jülich IPP, Garching** ASCR, Czech Rep

### NSTX completed operation in Fall 2010 for start of NSTX-Upgrade construction

## **NSTX-U** research goals address key issues that need to be resolved for next-step Spherical Tokamaks (ST)

- 1. Advance ST for Fusion Nuclear Science Facility (FNSF), including noninductive operation
  - 100% non-inductive operation
  - Stable high-performance, steady-state control
- 2. Develop solutions for plasma-material interface challenge
  - Mitigation of high heat flux (q<sub>peak</sub>~40 MW/m<sup>2</sup>, P<sub>heat</sub>/S~0.5 MW/m<sup>2</sup>)
  - Optimization of pedestal/SOL interface
- 3. Explore unique ST parameter regimes to advance predictive capability for ITER and beyond
  - Access reduced collisionality
  - Role of high ExB and parallel flow shear
  - Understand enhanced confinement and stability

#### NSTX-Upgrade will access next factor of two increase in performance to bridge gaps to next-step STs



🔘 NSTX-U

### 1. Advance ST for Fusion Nuclear Science Facility (FNSF), including non-inductive operation

- 100% non-inductive operation
- Stable high-performance, steady-state control
- Free-boundary TRANSP predictive simulations indicate mixture of sources necessary to achieve 100% stable, non-inductive operation
  - Has been used for ITER scenario development (R. Budny, F. Poli)



#### Topics to be discussed

- Coaxial Helicity Injection (CHI) physics (plasma initiation)
- HHFW deposition and losses (current ramp-up)
- NB (fast ion) physics and impact of MHD on CD (sustainment)
- Stability and control

#### Understand reconnection physics to extrapolate CHI discharge initiation to next-steps CHI Physics

- Resistive simulations have been performed using the extended-MHD NIMROD code – physics is 2D
- Simulations reproduce flux closure for expt'l conditions
- Flux closure/plasma current scales with injector voltage time decay, flux footprint as in experiment
- Simulations indicate Sweet-Parker type reconnection
  - Elongated current sheet
  - Current sheet width
  - Inflow/outflow
- Extrapolates to 400 kA startup current in NSTX-U
  R. Raman, TH/6-55, Wed. PM





F. Ebrahimi, Phys. Plasmas 20 090702 (2014)



5

### Understand HHFW propagation and losses in order to use it effectively for current ramp-up

- AORSA simulations predict reduced HHFW SOL field amplitudes at low SOL density (n<sub>ant</sub>)
  - Waves evanescent at low n<sub>ant</sub>
  - Waves propagate at high n<sub>ant</sub>
  - Higher SOL losses at higher n<sub>ant</sub>
    - Consistent with experiment

Possible ICRF coupling issues in ITER – large outer gap, similar harmonic range





n<sub>cutoff</sub> will be at higher n<sub>SOL</sub> in NSTX-U

$$n_{SOL,cutoff} \propto rac{k_{\parallel}^2 B}{w}$$

Wider SOL density range with lower SOL losses

N. Bertelli, Nuc. Fusion 54 083004 (2014)



**HHFW Physics** 

## Understanding and predicting fast ion physics critical for optimizing NB current drive

**NBI Physics** 

- NSTX/NSTX-U well equipped to explore broad range of Energetic Particle (EP) scenarios as required for projections to ITER, FNSF
- Redistribution of fast ions due to EP modes impact NBCD
- Mapping unstable regimes guides development of discharges with reduced or suppressed MHD



Low-f MHD mapped through M3D-K code



G.-Y. Fu Phys. Plasmas 20 102506 (2013)

7

# High frequency Alfvén activity can also impact NB heating and current drive

- High frequency (Global/Compressional) Alfven activity modified by 3D fields
  - Change in bursting, chirping frequencies
  - Modified  $\partial F / \partial v_{\perp}$  due to 3D fields
  - Assess whether RMP coils will impact AE and/or alpha/NBI fast-particle confinement for ITER (and FNSF)
- HYM code shows coupling of CAEs to Kinetic Alfven waves
  - Energy channeling from fast ions to CAE (at r/a~0) to KAW (r/a~0.3)
  - Estimate power channeling of up to ~ 0.4 MW over range of realistic (inferred) mode amplitudes (for one mode)
  - Critical for NB heating/CD profiles & thermal electron transport studies



A. Bortolon PRL 110 265008 (2013)





### Rotation control is critical to plasma stability

- Kinetic RWM stability theory and comparison to NSTX sets the stage for practical use in NSTX-U for disruption avoidance
  - Optimum rotation frequency for stability found
- NSTX-U controller will use Neoclassical Toroidal Viscosity (NTV) physics for the first time in rotation feedback control
  - Control toward optimum rotation frequency
- Physics basis of NTV being studied using NTVTOK (S. Sabbagh, EX/1-4), POCA (K. Kim)



Instability measure (RFA) vs. exp.  $\omega_{E}$  for NSTX

**Stability** 



J. Berkery, Phys. Plasmas 056112 (2014)



9

#### 2. Develop solutions for plasma-material interface challenge

- Mitigation of high heat flux (q<sub>peak</sub>~40 MW/m<sup>2</sup>, P<sub>heat</sub>/S~0.5 MW/m<sup>2</sup>)
- Optimization of pedestal/SOL interface

#### Topics to be discussed

- Heat flux mitigation via divertor configuration and radiation
- Development and exploration of more resilient materials (liquid lithium)
- Attractive integrated core/pedestal/divertor performance regimes



## Modeling supports snowflake and impurity-seeded radiative divertors as heat flux mitigation candidates in NSTX-U



### Temperature-enhanced erosion leads to a continuous vapor-shielding regime

- In-situ measurements indicate enhanced Li erosion in NSTX divertor targets over restricted temperature range
- Lithium erosion studies conducted up to 1300C on Magnum-PSI plasma device to mimic expected NSTX-U divertor conditions
  - Lithium evaporated layer on Mo
  - Deuterium plasma
- Suppressed lithium emission observed at high temperatures and high D<sup>+</sup> fluxes due to lithium deuteride (LiD) formation
- Lithium trapping forms stable vapor cloud up to 1000C target temperature
  - Motivates continuously vapor-shielded divertor target studies for heat flux mitigation
  - NSTX-U will determine maximum Li PFC temperatures consistent with good confinement



## Enhanced Pedestal H-mode provides one attractive integrated core, pedestal and divertor scenario

Pedestal/SOL

- EP H-mode is a high performance scenario with high wide pedestal and excellent H<sub>98v2</sub> (up to 2)
- New discovery of long pulse EP H-mode lasting for duration of pulse
- Lithium conditioning integral
  - EP H-mode increases H<sub>98y,2</sub> by 50% over already enhanced H-factor with lithium
- Related to strong velocity shear
   Trigger with 3-D fields?
- Plan to couple with divertor solutions in NSTX-U



S. Gerhardt, Nuc. Fusion 54 083021 (2014)

## 3. Explore unique ST parameter regimes to advance predictive capability - for ITER and beyond

- Access reduced collisionality
- Role of high ExB and parallel flow shear
- Understand enhanced confinement and stability

Be able to predict confinement and transport

#### **Topics to be discussed**

- Highly anomalous electron transport
- Neoclassical vs anomalous ions
- Fast ion transport



# Electron transport at high collisionality well explained by microtearing modes

**Electron Transport** 

- Predictive TRANSP simulations using reduced transport model based on microtearing modes (Rebut-Lallia-Watkins, 1988)
  - T<sub>e</sub> predictions agree with measurements when microtearing predicted to be dominant
- At low collisionality, microtearing subdominant
  - Poor agreement
  - Need to develop predictive model when microtearing subdominant
- Need to develop predictive model for influence of CAE/KAW in very core



S. Kaye, Phys. Plasmas 21 082510 (2014)

### Strong flow shear can <u>destabilize</u> Kelvin-Helmholtz instability

IonTransport



- Linear theory:  $|ML_n/L_{\omega}| > 1$  for instability
- Non-linear global **GTS** simulations indicate Kelvin-Helmholtz (K-H) unstable in L-mode
  - K-H identified in simulation by finite  $k_{\parallel}$
- K-H/ITG turbulence + neoclassical ion transport within factor of ~2 of expt'l level

– e<sup>-</sup> transport seriously underestimated





0.5

0.0

-0.5

FEC 2014 - OV4-3, S. Kaye (presented by S. Sabbagh)

#### Predictive capability for fast ion response to Alfvén Eigenmodes has been developed Fast ion transport

- New "kick" model being implemented in NUBEAM/TRANSP M. Podesta, EX/10-4, Fri. PM
  - Models phase-space kicks in constants of motion from multiple instabilities with time-varying amplitudes
  - Provides accurate estimates for fast ion distribution function and NB-driven current
- Initial validation with stand-alone NUBEAM successful for TAEs, kink-like modes on NSTX M. Podesta, PPCF 56 055003 (2014)





- 1.5D Critical Gradient Model (CGM) predicts relaxed fast ion profiles for given instabilities
   N. Gorelenkov, EX/10-4, Fri. PM
- Both models potentially useful for FNSF, ITER predictions



### NSTX-U research aims to establish physics basis for next-step STs such as an FNSF and Pilot Plant

- Develop and implement techniques for non-inductive operation from startup to sustainment
- Develop solutions to projected high heat fluxes to the PFCs
- Explore unique ST parameter regime to advance predictive capability at low collisionality, high beta and high flow and flow shear
- NSTX-U research operations will commence in Spring 2015





### **NSTX-U Presentations at the 2014 IAEA**

- Orals
  - Physical Characteristics of Neoclasical Toroidal Viscosity in Tokamaks for Rotation Control and the Evaluation of Plasma Response (S. Sabbagh), EX/1-4 – Tuesday AM
  - Effects of MHD Instabilities on Neutral Beam Current Drive (M. Podesta given by W. Heidbrink), EX/10-4 –
    Friday PM
  - Configuration studies for an ST-based Fusion Nuclear Science Facility (J. Menard given by L. El-Guebala), FNS/1-1 – Saturday AM
- Posters
  - Developing and Validating Predictive Models for Fast Ion Relaxation in Burning Plasmas (N. Gorelenkov), TH/P1-2 – Tuesday AM
  - Computation of Resistive Instabilities in Tokamaks with Full Toroidal Geometry and Coupling Using DCON (J.-K. Park), TH/P1-5 – Tuesday AM
  - Full Wave Simulations for Fast Wave Heating and Power Losses in the Scrape-off Layer of Tokamak Plasmas (N. Bertelli), TH/P4-14 – Wednesday PM
  - Impact of 3D Fields on Divertor Detachment in NSTX and DIII-D (J.-W. Ahn), EX/P6-53 Thursday PM
  - Experimental Observation of Nonlocal Electron Thermal Transport in NSTX RF-Heated L-Mode Plasmas (Y. Ren), EX/P6-43 – Thursday PM
  - The Role of Lithium Conditioning in Achieving High Performance, Long Pulse H-Mode Discharges in the NSTX and EAST Devices (R. Maingi), EX/P6-54 – Thursday PM
  - Modeling Divertor Concepts for Spherical Tokamaks NSTX, NSTX-U, and ST-FNSF (E. Meier), TH/P6-50
    Thursday PM
  - Transient CHI Plasma Start-up Simulations and Projections to NSTX-U (R. Raman), TH/P6-55 Thursday PM
  - Progress Toward Commissioning and Plasma Operation in NSTX-U (M. Ono), FIP/P8-30 Friday PM

### Backup



## NSTX-Upgrade will access next factor of two increase in performance to bridge gaps to next-step STs

- Collisionality for transport and stability
   • f<sub>BS</sub> (boostrap fraction) for non-inductive CD
- P/S for divertor heat loading



#### NSTX-Upgrade will access next factor of two increase in performance to bridge gaps to next-step STs





#### NSTX completed operation in Fall 2010 for start of Upgrade construction

 NSTX-Upgrade will access next factor of two increase in performance to bridge gaps to next-step STs

NSTX

Upgrade

0.94

≥ 1.5

2

≤ 19\*

20

0.4-0.6

NSTX

0.86

≥ 1.3

1

0.5

≤ 8

10

0.2



**Fusion** 

Nuclear

Science

Facility

1.3

≥ 1.5

4 - 10

2 - 3

22 - 45

30 - 60

0.6 - 1.2

1 - 2

Pilot Plant

1.6 - 2.2

≥ 1.7

11 - 18

2.4 - 3

50 - 85

70 - 90

0.7 - 0.9

2 - 10

Low-A Power Plants



ARIES-ST (A=1.6)



$\bigcirc$	NSTX-U

**Parameter** 

Major Radius R<sub>0</sub> [m]

Plasma Current [MA]

Auxiliary Power [MW]

Aspect Ratio  $R_0/a$ 

Toroidal Field [T]

P/R [MW/m]

P/S [MW/m<sup>2</sup>]

Fusion Gain Q

FEC 2014 – OV4-3, S. Kaye (presented by S. Sabbagh)

# Understand reconnection physics to extrapolate CHI discharge initiation to next-steps

**CHI Physics** 

- Resistive simulations have been performed using the extended-MHD NIMROD code – physics is 2D
- Simulations with magnetic diffusivities similar to exp't produce flux closure
- Flux closure/plasma current scales with injector voltage time decay, flux footprint as in experiment
- Simulations indicate Sweet-Parker type reconnection
  - Elongated current sheet
  - Current sheet width
  - Inflow/outflow



F. Ebrahimi

# Understand reconnection physics to extrapolate CHI discharge initiation to next-steps

**CHI Physics** 

- Resistive simulations have been performed using the extended-MHD NIMROD code – physics is 2D
- Simulations reproduce flux closure for expt'l conditions
- Flux closure/plasma current scales with injector voltage time decay, flux footprint as in experiment
- Simulations indicate Sweet-Parker type reconnection
  - Elongated current sheet
  - Current sheet width
  - Inflow/outflow



F. Ebrahimi

#### Understand reconnection physics to extrapolate CHI discharge initiation to next-steps CHI Physics

- Resistive simulations have been performed using the extended-MHD NIMROD code – physics is 2D
- Simulations reproduce flux closure for expt'l conditions
- Flux closure/plasma current scales with injector voltage time decay, flux footprint as in experiment
- Simulations indicate Sweet-Parker type reconnection
  - Elongated current sheet
  - Current sheet width
  - Inflow/outflow



#### Understand reconnection physics to extrapolate CHI discharge initiation to next-steps CHI Physics

- Resistive simulations have been performed using the extended-MHD NIMROD code – physics is 2D
- Simulations reproduce flux closure for expt'l conditions
- Flux closure/plasma current scales with injector voltage time decay, flux footprint as in experiment
- Simulations indicate Sweet-Parker type reconnection
  - Elongated current sheet
  - Current sheet width
  - Inflow/outflow



### Understand HHFW propagation and losses in order to use it effectively for current ramp-up

**HHFW Physics** 

- AORSA simulations predict reduced HHFW SOL field amplitudes at low SOL density (n<sub>ant</sub>)
  - Wave is evanescent at low density
  - Wave can propagate at higher density
- Higher SOL losses at higher density
  - Consistent with experiment





### Understand HHFW propagation and losses in order to use effectively for current ramp-up

**HHFW Physics** 

- HHFW field amplitude depends on location of righthand cutoff
  - When region in front of antenna is cut off (low  $n_{SOL}$ ), low field amplitudes
  - When region in front of antenna is propagating (high  $n_{SOL}$ ), high field amplitudes

AORSA simulations predict reduced SOL losses with existence of evanescent region at low SOL density  $(n_{ant})$ 





### Understand HHFW propagation and losses in order to use effectively for current ramp-up

**HHFW Physics** 

- HHFW field amplitude depends on location of righthand cutoff
  - When region in front of antenna is cut off (low  $n_{SOL}$ ), low field amplitudes
  - When region in front of antenna is propagating (high  $n_{SOL}$ ), high field amplitudes



# Understand HHFW propagation and losses in order to use it effectively for current ramp-up

**HHFW Physics** 

- AORSA simulations predict reduced HHFW SOL field amplitudes at low SOL density (n<sub>ant</sub>)
  - Wave is evanescent at low density
  - Wave can propagate at higher density
- Higher SOL losses at higher density
  - Consistent with experiment





 $n_{cutoff}$  will be at higher  $n_{SOL}$  in NSTX-U  $k_{\mu}^2 B$ 

$$n_{SOL,cutoff} \propto \frac{\kappa_{\parallel}}{W}$$

Wider SOL density range with lower SOL losses



# High frequency Alfvén activity can also impact NB heating and current drive

- High frequency (Global/Compressional) Alfven activity modified by 3D fields
  - Change in bursting, chirping frequencies
  - Modified  $\partial F / \partial v_{\perp}$  due to 3D fields
  - Assess whether RMP coils will impact AE and/or alpha/NBI fast-particle confinement for ITER (and FNSF)
- HYM code shows coupling of CAEs to Kinetic Alfven waves
  - Energy channeling from fast ions to CAE (at r/a~0) to KAW (r/a~0.3)
  - Estimate power channeling of up to ~ 0.4 MW over range of realistic (inferred) mode amplitudes (for one mode)
  - Critical for NB heating/CD profiles & thermal electron transport studies



<u>Future Work</u>: Perform non-linear HYM simulations to calculate actual level of energy transfer and effect on  $T_e$ ; develop predictive capability

E. Belova

# Understanding the physics basis for NTV crucial for predicting effects in NSTX-U

- POCA, NTVTOK Indicate importance of kinetic resonances, collisionality
- NTVTOK
  - Valid for all collisionality regimes for  $e^-$ ,  $i^+$
  - Importance of finite orbit effects average flux surface δr over banana width)
- POCA
  - Follows individual guiding center orbits
  - Calculates δf in non-axisymmetric ideal equilibrium determined by IPEC



Understanding rotation braking from RMP will be important for ITER ELM control

### An integrated disruption Prediction-Avoidance-Mitigation (PAM) framework is being developed

- Key elements are:
  - State-space controller for stability control
  - Physics-based disruption warning algorithm with >96% success rate
  - MGI system with gas injection at different poloidal locations





Control

## Lithium wall conditioning influences pedestal profiles and microstability characteristics

- Higher T<sub>e</sub>, T<sub>i</sub> with lithium
- Lower pedestal density, wider n<sub>e</sub> pedestal (top moves in)

 Microtearing impt at pedestal top, TEM/KBM in gradient region (GS2)



### Both neoclassical and MHD processes important for understanding power deposition

 Heat flux widths controlled by neoclassical processes in collisionless limit, scaling as 1/I<sub>p</sub><sup>1/2</sup>

- Expt scales as 1/I<sub>p</sub><sup>0.8</sup>

- ELMs and macrostability characteristics influence heat deposition
  - Lower n MHD leads to fewer striations, narrower heat flux width



### Tokamak and test stand PMI studies support plans for metal substrates to be used on NSTX-U

- In-situ measurements indicate temperatureenhanced Li sputtering for lithiated graphite and lithiated Mo substrates
- Lithium erosion studies conducted up to 1300C on Magnum-PSI plasma device to mimic NSTX-U
  - Lithium evaporated layer
  - Deuterium plasma
- Studies find suppressed lithium emission at high temperatures
  - High D flux results in LiD mixed material
  - Results in reduced Li evap., increased D sputtering
- Lithium trapping forms stable vapor cloud up to 1000C
  - Motivates continuously vapor-shielded divertor target studies
  - Need to re-evaluate acceptable Li PFC temperature limits in NSTX-U





## Modeling supports snowflake and impurity-seeded radiative divertors as heat flux mitigation candidates in NSTX-U

Heat flux mitigation



### Test stand PMI studies support plans for Li-coated metal substrates to be used on NSTX-U

- Lithium erosion studies conducted up to 1300C on Magnum-PSI plasma device to mimic NSTX-U
  - Lithium evaporated layer on Mo
  - Deuterium plasma
- Studies find suppressed lithium emission at high temperatures
  - High D flux results in LiD mixed material
    - Expected in NSTX-U divertor
  - Results in reduced Li evap., increased D sputtering
- Lithium trapping forms stable vapor cloud up to 1000C target temperature
  - Motivates continuously vapor-shielded divertor target studies
  - Need to re-evaluate acceptable Li PFC temperature limits in NSTX-U



# Enhanced Pedestal H-mode offers opportunity for high-performance (H<sub>98y,2</sub>~1.5 to 2)

High performance



- Spontaneous trigger from H-phase
- MHD quiescent, confinement at levels necessary for FNSF
- Strong edge velocity shear may provide reliable trigger for mode

- Through 3D fields?



