## Impact of impurities on energy confinement bifurcation at density above the Greenwald limit in DIII-D high- $\beta_P$ plasmas

S. Ding<sup>1\*</sup>, S. Shi<sup>2</sup>, A.M. Garofalo<sup>1</sup>, B. Van Compernolle<sup>1</sup>, D.B. Weisberg<sup>1</sup>, H. Wang<sup>1</sup>, D. Eldon<sup>1</sup>, B.S. Victor<sup>3</sup>, A. Marinoni<sup>4</sup>, Q.M. Hu<sup>5</sup>, I.S. Carvalho<sup>1</sup>, L. Wang<sup>6</sup>, A.W. Hyatt<sup>1</sup>, T.H. Osborne<sup>1</sup>, X.Z. Gong<sup>6</sup>, J.P. Qian<sup>6</sup>, J. Huang<sup>6</sup>, C.T. Holcomb<sup>3</sup> and J.M. Hanson<sup>7</sup>

<sup>1</sup>General Atomics, PO Box 85608, San Diego, California 92186-5608, USA

<sup>2</sup>Oak Ridge Associated Universities, Oak Ridge, TN 37831, United States of America

<sup>3</sup>Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, Livermore, California

<sup>4</sup>University of California San Diego, La Jolla, CA, 92093, USA

<sup>5</sup>Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ, 08543, USA

<sup>6</sup>Institute of Plasma Physics, Chinese Academy of Sciences, PO Box 1126, Hefei, Anhui 230031, China

<sup>7</sup>Department of Applied Mathematics and Applied Physics, Columbia University, New York, New York 10027-6900, USA

\*Email: dingsiye@fusion.gat.com

A bifurcation of global confinement, which is associated with core impurity levels, has been observed in DIII-D high poloidal-beta ( $\beta_P$ ) experiments, enabling further improved energy confinement at lineaveraged density above the Greenwald limit ( $f_{Gr}=\bar{n}_e/n_{Gr}>1$ ). It can be recognized as a third bifurcation in the high- $\beta_P$  plasmas after the first bifurcation which triggers the transition to H-mode and the second one which forms large-radius internal transport barrier (ITB). Both DIII-D database (non-high- $\beta_P$  and high- $\beta_P$ ) and the ITPA international database suggest decreased maximum H<sub>98y2</sub> at increased density in experiment. At IAEA FEC 2023, we reported the first-time achievement in tokamak H-mode experiments --- the development of DIII-D high- $\beta_P$  scenario with simultaneous density above the Greenwald limit ( $f_{Gr}$  up to 1.25) and  $H_{98y2}$ ~1.5 [1, 2]. Most recent high- $\beta_P$  experiment on DIII-D has another breakthrough, achieving fGr~1.45 and H98y2~1.4 at even slightly higher plasma current. Although the exciting experimental results extend the operating boundary towards an uncharted regime, detailed analysis reveals the existence of secondary global



Fig. 1 Grey dots:  $H_{98y2}$  and  $\bar{n}_e$  at different time slices in DIII-D #190900. A smoothing window of 50 ms is applied to  $H_{98y2}$ .

confinement bifurcations in these plasmas, indicating the impurity effect on limiting energy confinement quality at high density. This synopsis reports a relatively higher confinement state and a relatively lower confinement state at the same density above the Greenwald limit in some high- $\beta_P$  discharges. Lower confinement relates to higher core radiated power induced by intrinsic high-Z impurities on DIII-D.



Fig. 2 Time histories of DIII-D #190897 (blue) and #190904 (green). Shaded area indicates the period that reduced energy confinement happens along with higher high-Z impurity emission.

Fig. 1 shows an example of energy confinement bifurcation and the lower confinement branch shows a rollover in the plot of  $H_{98y2}$  vs  $\bar{n}_e$ , indicating reduced  $H_{98y2}$  at higher density, while the higher confinement branch suggests higher  $H_{98y2}$  with no rollover observed. The equilibria at 2.58 s and at 3.26 s both have ITBs at the same large radius, resulting in close  $\bar{n}_e$  and similar  $H_{98y2}$ . However, divergence is observed at higher density. The transition from the lower confinement branch to the higher one happens at 2.99 s in DIII-D #190900, due to a minor  $\beta$ -collapse.  $H_{98y2}$  in the lower confinement branch evolves to <1.4 later at higher density, while that of in the higher confinement branch reaches >1.7.

Fig. 2 shows another example when comparing two similar high- $\beta_P$  discharges at density above the Greenwald limit. These two discharges have the

same I<sub>p</sub> and B<sub>T</sub>, and they have very similar plasma performance at the same D<sub>2</sub> gas puffing rate before 3.5 s. The experiment aims at pursuing higher density at higher level of active gas puffing. When higher feedforward D<sub>2</sub> gas puffing rate is applied on #190897 (blue), higher line-averaged density is achieved successfully. But reduced H<sub>98y2</sub> and T<sub>e,0</sub> are also observed together with various increased high-Z impurity line-emission (e.g. Fe<sup>23+</sup>, Ni<sup>25+</sup> and Mo<sup>31+</sup>) from 3.7 s (shaded area in fig. 2). Note that although the PFC material of main chamber and divertors of DIII-D is carbon, there are some intrinsic high-Z metallic impurities from Inconel vacuum vessel and RF antenna

straps. The increased high-Z impurities cause higher radiated power in the plasma core, which leads to decreasing plasma performance  $(\beta_N)$  and energy confinement (H<sub>98v2</sub>) until compensation from increased injected power. Although the discharge is under  $\beta_N$  feedback control, the control system does not respond to the decrease of  $\beta_N$ immediately, e.g. 3.7 s - 3.85 s. This is because the  $\beta_N$  is above the feedback target when the confinement starts to drop. With additional 0.7 MW NBI power later on,  $\beta_N$  is sustained at the feedback target, and H<sub>98v2</sub> is also maintained, however, at a level lower than the previous achieved value at 3.7 s. The  $H_{98v2}$  is also lower than that of the discharge (green in fig. 2) without increased gas puffing and increased impurity emissions. As shown in fig. 2, the pedestal density and temperature are almost identical in these two discharges after 3.7 s, when the divergence of energy confinement emerges. This confirms that the change in the core is responsible for the reduced confinement. MHD behaviors for n=1, 2, 3 are also almost identical.



Fig. 3 Profiles of DIII-D #190900 at 2.585 s (blue) and 3.585 s (red). Shaded area indicates impurity pinch predicted by neoclassical theory for the 2.585 s case.

Studying the different confinement branches could lead to better understanding of how to maximize H<sub>98y2</sub> at high density. Detailed profile analysis suggests that lower H<sub>98y2</sub> branch is associated with too high density gradient along or not high enough temperature gradient. Fig. 3 shows one example from the discharges in fig. 1. The lower H<sub>98y2</sub> case has strong main ion density gradient at  $\rho$ ~0.6-0.7 (fig. 3(b)), which results in strong impurity pinch effect (fig. 3(d)) according to neoclassical theory, radial transport R( $\Gamma_z^{neo}$ )  $\propto \frac{1}{z} \frac{R}{L_{nz}} - \frac{R}{L_{ni}} + \frac{1}{2} \frac{R}{L_{Ti}}$  [3], where L<sub>n</sub> and L<sub>T</sub> are scale lengths of density and temperature (e.g. L<sub>n</sub>=n/ $\nabla$ n), respectively. High gradient in T<sub>i</sub> profile indeed offsets the neoclassical impurity radial transport outwards. The impurity inward transport region becomes smaller when taking the contribution of T<sub>i</sub> term into account, i.e. comparing the shaded area in fig. 3(c) and 3(d). Unfortunately, the T<sub>i</sub> gradient in the lower H<sub>98y2</sub> case has weaker impurity pinch effect from L<sub>ni</sub> term, and has stronger outward transport contribution from L<sub>Ti</sub> term. It leads to a feature of net outward impurity neoclassical radial transport from magnetic axis to pedestal. The analysis is qualitatively consistent with the experimental observations of lower impurity core radiation in the higher H<sub>98y2</sub> cases.

In conclusion, the preliminary analysis suggests that the level of core radiation induced by impurity accumulation is responsible for the observed energy confinement bifurcation in the high- $\beta_P$  plasmas at density around the Greenwald limit. Further analysis of the turbulent impurity transport will be considered in the next step. The existence of higher energy confinement branch indicates that there could be a balance between density gradient and temperature gradient for optimized impurity transport. Knowing the governing physics, potential experimental approaches to further control impurity accumulations in the high- $\beta_P$  plasmas can be developed and lead to improved energy confinement quality at line-averaged density above the Greenwald limit.

## Acknowledgements

This work was supported in part by the US Department of Energy under DE-FC02-04ER54698 and DE-SC0010685, DE-AC52-07NA27344, DE-FG02-04ER54761, DE-AC02-09CH11466 and DE-SC0016154).

## Reference

- [1] S. Ding et al., 29th IAEA FEC EX/P2-7, Oct. 16-21, 2016, London, UK
- [2] S. Ding et al., Nature 629 (2024) 555
- [3] C. Angioni, Plasma Phys. Control. Fusion 63 (2021) 073001