# The use of AI in food safety and food fraud: early warning systems

### Hans Marvin & Yamine Bouzembrak (WFSR)





IAEA: Technical Meeting on Artificial Intelligence for Nuclear Technology and Applications (25-29 October 2021)

## Outline

- State of the Art
  - Motivation
  - Experience (including limitations)
  - Challenges of AI
- Next Steps & Future challenges



Reactive early warning approaches not satisfactory; proactive systems needed





### Drivers of change having direct/ indirect impact on food safety (Marvin et al 2019; https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.2903/sp.efsa.2019.EN-1619 )



## Potential system approach





### Bayesian Network (BN) approach

### Steps in the development





## Data sources used in the BN model

Linking 36 factors (18 data sources and 8 expert judgements)



## BN modelling applied in many cases

### **Example 2:** Prediction of food fraud type as reported in RASFF



#### BN model for fruits & vegetables

## BN model for food fraud type



FOOD

BN model for hazard prediction of NM hazard



Generally the prediction accuracy > 90%



3.30 Netherla 8020 Turkey 36.47 India

WAGENINGENUR

17

## Machine learning

In our studies we compared the prediction accuracy of BN to other (>20) machine learning algorithms:

- 1. Neural network
- 2. Logistic regression
- 3. Support vector machines
- 4. Random forest
- 5. Ensemble classifiers



## Prediction accuracy of BN was often superior in classification problems



Other AI approaches developed for early warning of food safety and food fraud

- Detecting food safety & food fraud trends from media (text mining, network analysis)
- Searching unknown food safety hazards in scientific literature (word embedding)
- Predicting food safety from satellite images and mobile pictures (deep learning)
- Automate data collection processing, analysis & visualization



Example: media & blogs using European Media Monitor (EMM); early warning & emerging risk

Collection, processing & visualization of media reports from EMM (food fraud, food supplements, various food safety topics)

✓ Search		Lucene 💼 🗸 Juli 1, 2018 @ 00:00:00.00 🔶 Jur	
+ Add filter			
n-stämularäs-ocunt 807 Count			New articles pe
n-stimulants-bars		exer-simulate-weblag	
-	existe		
			SCOTH SCOTH SCOT N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N
			KOHA BAR BAR N N Count O 1153- 0 1253- 0 1250- 0 1250- 0 100- 100- 100- 100- 100- 100- 100-
-stinuters are - - - - - - - - - - - - -			KOHA BAR BAR N N Count O 1153- 0 1253- 0 1250- 0 1250- 0 100- 100- 100- 100- 100- 100- 100-
stimulato area 200 de or 200 do or 200 di stimulatos tala 2 bapori Publication date			KOSEA STORE N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N
stimulate- area 	Cest 2 201-02 201-02 201-02 201-02 201-02 201-02 201-02 201-02 #bbrearweit	• Kratt	KOSEA STORE N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N
Altimularis- unes 2006 de o1 2016 ibi oc 2016 il Altimularis- table D. Esport Publication date no. 2,2019 (p. 02:000.000) n.5, 2019 (p. 02:000.000)	Син 1 дел то за то с по с то дел на с дел на с по с то дел на с рабо де чиса и Тике Спотога И, саза Мат. Тонеран зелота полова раз	Very mathematics / 102/102/102/102/102/102/102/102/102/102/	KREAL OF A COURT OF A
stimulates was advantates was advantates water advantates water	Cont     Table     Total     Contained and the state of the state	• Form • Vent <p< td=""><td>NORAC IN COMPANY INTERNA INTERNA</td></p<>	NORAC IN COMPANY INTERNA
sthukers en 	Cost      The      Cost and a second se	Vertes	KORA - B DE N Court
•         •	Cont     The     Enstroad V/C cash Mark Therapora Jahling controls of controls of     Sectional V/C cash Mark Therapora Jahling controls of     Control Mark Therapora Jahling controls of     Controls theraporate in the control of     Control Mark Therapora Jahling controls of     Controls theraporate in the control of     Control Mark Therapora Jahling controls of     Controls theraporate in the control of     Control Mark Therapora Jahling controls     Controls     The mark theraporation of     Control Mark Therapora Jahling controls     Controls     The mark theraporation     Control Mark Therapora Jahling controls     Control Mark Therapora Jahling controls     Control Mark Theraporation     Controls     The mark theraporation	v Portes         VII.           superment[VL0M1]         Superment[VL0M2]           superment[VL0M2]         Supermen	Count North Action Action Contraction C
- strategies         - strategies         - strategies           - generalized         - generalized         - generalized           - generalized         - generalized         - generalized           - Addressing and - A 2019 ge Concession         - a 2019 ge Concession         - a 2019 ge Concession           - a 1. 2019 ge Concession         - a 1. 2019 ge Concession         - a 1. 2019 ge Concession	Cost      The      Cost and a second an	Very set in the set i	KORA KORA
-strukter en 	Cost  Cost	Very set in the set i	Korsk -
estimuterés unes	Cont     The     Control     Control     The     Control     Control     The     Control     Control     The     Control     Contro     Contro     Contro     Control     Control     Control	p and (Lagranding) (Lagranding	Court     C

Detected 10 "unknown" compounds used as stimulant in food supplements





#### New trends and unsafe products (food supplements) detected

# Example: Network visualisation; early warning

## Food fraud publications in the media collected by the WFSR MedISys-FF filter also mentioning COVID



COVID-19 is expected to drive food fraud and food safety risks (meat and alcohol)



Example: Word embedding with scientific literature; emerging risk

Analyzing > 2 million abstracts and titles, 10 "unknown" stimulants were detected





Example: AI (deep learning) to predict food safety in grass & maize using satellite images (Sentinel-2); early warning

Efficiency of models: up to 62 % of individual hazards



Deep leaning to detect food safety hazards using mobile phone images

Deep leaning to detect melamine in milk powder using mobile phone images



Example: detection of abnormalities in drivers, prediction of hazards in milk and automatic alerts; early warning & emerging risk

Develop workflows in KNIME to automatically collected & process data from identified data sources to show abnormalities and to predict hazards in milk in the Netherlands



## Workflows of drivers and BN prediction results visualised in Dashboard





## Limitations (food safety/ food fraud domain)

- AI developments occur in other domains
- Slow uptake of technologies by authorities (lack of AI skills)
  - Lack of trained personnel => more education (secondary school, university)
- FAIR principle not well established
  - Embed FAIR principle in legal framework
- Communication on AI to society must be improved
  - Explainable AI
- Sharing data by stakeholders remains a big challenge
  - Federate learning a solution? (FAIR data train concept)



## Next steps: Federate learning a solution?



Source: Farm Data Train Blueprint. Luiz Bonino, 2018



# Next steps: AI integrated in hazard detection and assessment

Broad screening => AI to process large data streams

Internet of things (IoT) Onsite, online analysis Hand held devices



Fast processing technologies Data e-infrastructures





## Thank you

### Contact:

### <u>Hans.marvin@wur.nl</u>

### Yamine.bouzembrak@wur.nl

### **References:**



Hans J.P. Marvin \*, Yamine Bouzembrak, Esmée M. Janssen, H.J. van der Fels- Klerx, Esther D. van Asselt, Gijs A. Kleter

RIKILT - Wageningen UR, Akkermaalsbos 2, 6708 PD Wageningen, The Netherlands

### www.wur.eu/bigdata-foodsafety



END

#### Acknowledgement

The following persons have been involved in this research:

Lennert van Overbeeke Ningjing Liu Bram Steen Anand Gavai Wouter Hoenderdaal Leonieke van den Bulk Lukas van den Heuvel Wenjuan Mu Nathan Meijer Esther van Asselt Gijs Kleter Cangyu Jin Hans Mol



